

ADMINISTRATIVE CONFERENCE OF THE UNITED STATES

ACUS is an independent federal agency that develops recommendations to improve administrative process and procedure. ACUS also arranges for the interchange of useful information to carry out its mission. ACUS Information Interchange Bulletins are intended to help agencies and the public understand the administrative process. They should not be relied upon as legal documents.

Information Interchange Bulletin No. 008

Incorporation by Reference

What is incorporation by reference?

Incorporation by reference (IBR) is a term of art for the practice of codifying material published elsewhere by simply referring to it in the text of a regulation. The law treats material incorporated by reference as if it were set out fully in the regulation incorporating it.

Why do agencies use IBR?

IBR reduces the size and improves the readability of the Code of Federal Regulations (C.F.R.) and allows agencies to benefit from collaborative governance through public-private partnerships without violating copyright laws.

When is IBR allowed?

Agencies may incorporate by reference material that is "reasonably available to the class of persons affected" by the regulation and the promulgating agency secures the "approval of the Director of the Federal Register." 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(1). The Office of the Federal Register ("OFR") has regulations governing the process agencies must complete to secure the Director's approval to incorporate materials by reference in the C.F.R. See 1 C.F.R. pt. 51.

What kinds of materials do agencies incorporate by reference?

The C.F.R. contains thousands of incorporations by reference. Many are voluntary consensus standards — technical standards developed by private sector organizations using an open process that results in a consensus among participants representing a balance of interests. But IBR is also frequently used to incorporate things like state regulations, maps, and manuals.

How does an agency incorporate materials by reference?

A public or private entity develops material that an agency wishes to incorporate into its rules.

The agency publishes a notice in the *Federal Register* proposing to incorporate the material by reference in its regulations (5 U.S.C. § 553). The agency must summarize the material in the preamble of the proposed rule and discuss how the code or standard is "reasonably available" to interested parties (1 C.F.R. § 51.5(a)).

The agency provides the public an opportunity to comment on its proposed rule, including incorporating the material by reference (5 U.S.C. § 553).

The agency requests that the OFR Director approve the incorporation by reference by reference in a final rule (1 C.F.R. § 51.5(b)).

The OFR Director approves the incorporation by reference, provided the material is on file with OFR, the publishing agency affirms that the material is reasonably available, and the language of the preamble and final rule comply with OFR rules (1 C.F.R. § 51.3(b)).

The agency publishes a final rule that incorporates the material by reference using the proper language of incorporation, summarizes the incorporated material in the final rule's preamble, and ensures OFR has a file copy of the incorporated code or standard.

How do agencies update incorporations by reference?

Incorporation of material by reference is "limited to the edition of the publication that is approved" and does not include amendments or revisions. 1 C.F.R. § 51.1(f). One potential downside of IBR is that confusion may result when a regulation continues to incorporate a code or standard developed by a private-sector organization that has become outdated or that the private-sector organization has replaced with an updated edition. Agencies must follow the process in 1 C.F.R. § 51.11 to change or remove an approved incorporation.

Additional Resources

Emily S. Bremer, <u>Incorporation by Reference in an Open-Government Age</u>, 36 Harv. J.L. & Pub. PoL'Y 131 (2013)

ACUS Rec. 2011-5, Incorporation by Reference

OMB Circular A-119, Federal Participation in the Development and Use of Voluntary Consensus Standards and in Conformity Assessment Activities, 63 Fed. Reg. 8546 (Feb. 19, 1998)